## IN THE COURT OF APPEAL OF THE REPUBLIC OF VANUATU (Civil Appellate Jurisdiction)

Civil Appeal Case No. 20/1896 CoA/CIVA

	<u>BETWÉEN</u> :	FAMILY TURA Appellant INDIGENE LAWYERS
	<u>AND</u> :	FAMILY MOLTANMAUTE First Respondent
	<u>AND</u> :	FAMILY ATKIN Second Respondent
	AND:	TAFTUMOL Third Respondent SUGDEN LAWYERS
	AND:	FAMILY LOIROR LIN Fourth Respondent
	<u>AND</u> :	FAMILY WARAWARA and VARAOVARAO Fifth Respondent
Date of Hearing:	13 November 2020	
Coram:	Hon. Chief Justice V. Lunabek Hon. Justice J. Mansfield Hon. Justice R. Young Hon. Justice D. Aru Hon. Justice G. Andrée Wiltens Hon. Justice V.M. Trief	
In Attendance:	<i>Mr J. Ngwele and Mr C. Leo for the Appellant Mrs M.G. Nari for the Second Respondent Mr A. Godden for the Third Respondent Mr E. Molbaleh for the Fourth Respondent Mr D. Yawha for the Fifth Respondent</i>	
Date of Decision:	20 November 2020	

## JUDGMENT

1. When this matter was called, we raised with counsel for the Appellant whether the Appellant had a right of appeal from the Supreme Court to the Court of Appeal (section 22(4), *Island Courts Act*).



- 2. After consideration, counsel for the Appellant accepted that there was no such jurisdiction. In those circumstances, the Appellant consented to the appeal being dismissed. The appeal is therefore dismissed.
- 3. As to costs, counsel for the Third Respondent sought indemnity costs. None of the other Respondents sought costs. We are not satisfied that this is a case which justifies indemnity costs. In their submissions the Third Respondent raised the question of this Court's jurisdiction to hear this appeal. However, we note that the basis on which the respondent sought indemnity costs in their submissions was based on a different assertion.
- 4. We acknowledge that after the Third Respondent raised the question of this Court's jurisdiction to consider this appeal, the Third Respondent was put to further work in completing reply submissions as well as the preparation of an affidavit. In those circumstances, while we do not order indemnity costs, we will order greater costs than would ordinarily be the case. The Appellant therefore will pay costs to the Third Respondent of VT100,000.

## DATED at Port Vila this 20th day of November 2020

BY THE COURT Chief Justice V. Lunabek